

EXPOSURE DRAFT OF A PROPOSED CIRCULAR X/2019

HEADLINE EARNINGS

November 2019

This proposed Circular has been issued by the South African Institute of Chartered Accountants (SAICA) at the request of the JSE Limited (JSE). The exposure draft issued by SAICA is released for public comment in South Africa by the Accounting Practices Committee (APC).

Comments received on the proposed Circular will be discussed by the JSE and the APC in finalising the Circular for issue.

One copy of written comment should be addressed to:

Project Director – Financial Reporting Standards
File Reference APC – ED 402
Private Bag X32
Northlands
2116

Comments can also be emailed to:

bongekan@saica.co.za

Your comments should be dispatched so as to be received by no later than **5 December 2019**. All replies will be regarded as being public record unless confidentiality is requested.

HEADLINE EARNINGS**CONTENTS**

	<i>Paragraphs</i>
Preface	
Introduction	.01 – .03
SECTION A: BACKGROUND	
Background to the use of headline earnings in South Africa	.04 – .10
Headline earnings and IFRS, including accounting policy choices	.11 – .13
SECTION B: DEFINITIONS	.14
SECTION C: DETAILED RULES FOR HEADLINE EARNINGS	.15 – .16
Calculation of headline earnings	.17 – .20
Detailed rules table per IFRS	.21 – .22
SECTION D: THE PRESENTATION OF HEADLINE EARNINGS PER SHARE	
Diluted headline earnings	.23
Number of shares	.24
Comparative headline earnings	.25 – .26
Format of the headline earnings reconciliation	.27 – .29
Example of the long-form headline earnings reconciliation	.30
Example of the short-form headline earnings reconciliation	.31
SECTION E: HEADLINE EARNINGS PER LINKED UNIT	.32 – .35
SECTION F: EFFECTIVE DATE	.36 – .41
SECTION G: CREATION OF SECTOR-SPECIFIC RULES FOR HEADLINE EARNINGS	.42
SECTION H: BASIS FOR CONCLUSIONS	.43 – .48
Distinction between re-measurements and operating/trading	.49 – .51
Specific adjustments considered when issuing Circular 8/2007	.52 – .54
The impact of accounting policy choices on headline earnings	.55 – .56
Treatment of IAS 39 re-measurements	.57 – .60
IAS 39 reclassified re-measurements	.61 – .62
Separately identifiable re-measurements	.63
Format of the headline earnings reconciliation	.64
The inclusion of a definition of “operating/trading” and “platform”	.65 – .68
Specific matters considered when issuing Circular 3/2009	.69 – .75
Specific matters considered when issuing Circular 3/2012	.76
Specific matters considered when issuing Circular 2/2013	.77 – .79
Specific matters considered when issuing Circular 2/2015	.80
Specific matters considered when issuing Circular 4/2018	.81 - .84
Specific matters considered when issuing Circular X/2019	.85 - .86

HEADLINE EARNINGS

Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)

SECTION I: SECTOR-SPECIFIC RULES FOR HEADLINE EARNINGS .87

Issue 1: Re-measurements relating to private equity activities (associates or joint ventures) regarded as operating/trading activities

Relevant sector: Listed Banks .88 – .98

Issue 2: The re-measurement of investment property

Relevant sector: Financial – Listed Life Insurance (other sectors must apply this rule to their long-term insurer and its subsidiaries and associates) .99 – .108

SECTION J: CHANGES MADE TO THE DETAILED RULES TABLE .109 – .115

The detailed rules before the changes introduced by Circular 3/2009

The detailed rules before the changes introduced by Circular 3/2012

The detailed rules before the changes introduced by Circular 2/2013

The detailed rules before the changes introduced by Circular 2/2015

The detailed rules before the changes introduced by Circular 4/2018

The detailed rules before the changes introduced by Circular X/2019

PREFACE

This Circular has been issued by the South African Institute of Chartered Accountants (SAICA) at the request of the JSE Limited (JSE). The JSE Listings Requirements require the calculation of headline earnings and disclosure of a detailed reconciliation of headline earnings to the earnings numbers used in the calculation of basic earnings per share in accordance with the requirements of IAS 33 – *Earnings per Share*. Disclosure of headline earnings is not a requirement of International Financial Reporting Standards (IFRS).

SAICA acknowledges that headline earnings is only one possible measure of an entity's performance, and the disclosure of headline earnings may be made in addition to the presentation of revenue, expenses, gains and losses in accordance with IFRS. Furthermore, headline earnings is not a mechanism to use in order to adjust an entity's financial results for disagreements an entity might have with the application of IFRS, or to circumvent the correct accounting treatment.

INVITATION TO COMMENT

The JSE and SAICA's Accounting Practices Committee (APC) invite comments on the proposed Circular X/2019 – *Headline Earnings*, which will supersede Circular 4/2018.

Introduction

In this proposal, the JSE and SAICA's APC proposes to amend Circular 4/2018. The proposed amendment seeks to amend the detailed rules in paragraph 21 pertaining to IFRS 16 – *Leases*.

Background

The JSE and SAICA's APC received a request for clarification of the treatment of penalties payable upon the termination of a lease that were not initially contracted for in the lease agreement. The request specifically related to the headline earnings treatment of such termination payments.

Circular 4/2018 refers to an IFRS 16 adjustment "Net gain or loss arising from partial or full termination of a lease." It is unclear whether this wording included such termination payment. Moreover, Circular 4/2018 indicates this adjustment as being out of headline earnings. Circular 4/2018 also indicated that the "Remaining amount of the remeasurement of the lease liability to reflect changes to the lease payments recognised in profit or loss" is recognised in headline earnings.

The JSE and SAICA's APC in their deliberations, noted that these items are not separately identifiable re-measurements, as defined, as they are not explicitly required by IFRS 16 to be separately disclosed. Accordingly, they should not be excluded from earnings and thus should remain in headline earnings.

The proposed amendment updates Circular 4/2018 to indicate that the "Net gain or loss arising from partial or full termination of a lease" and the "Remaining amount of the remeasurement of the lease liability to reflect changes to the lease payments recognised in profit or loss" are not separately identifiable re-measurements as defined and are therefore not excluded from headline earnings.

Question 1

Do you agree with the JSE and SAICA's APC proposal to amend Circular 4/2018 in the manner described in this exposure draft? If not, why not, and what do you recommend instead?

Question 2

This exposure draft proposes that Circular X/2019 – *Headline Earnings* be effective for financial periods (interim and/or annual periods) ending on or after 31 December 2019. Do you agree with the proposal? If not, why not, and what do you recommend instead?

Comments should be submitted in writing so as to be received by no later than **5 December 2019**.

INTRODUCTION

- .01 The requirement to disclose headline earnings has been a reporting requirement for companies listed on the JSE Limited (JSE) since 2000.
- .02 The original guidance on headline earnings was provided in AC 306 – *Headline Earnings – The Effect of the Issue of AC103 (revised) on the Calculation and Disclosure of Earnings Per Share*, issued in November 1995. This guidance was amended in Circular 7/2002 and was largely rewritten when this Circular was superseded by Circular 8/2007. Thereafter Circular 8/2007 and its replacement Circulars were updated for amendments and revisions to International Financial Reporting Standards (IFRS) and for a reconsideration of some of the detailed rules. The sequence of Circulars is as follows:
- (i) Circular 8/2007 was superseded by Circular 3/2009;
 - (ii) Circular 3/2009 was replaced by Circular 3/2012;
 - (iii) Circular 3/2012 was replaced by Circular 2/2013;
 - (iv) Circular 2/2015 replaced Circular 2/2013;
 - (v) Circular 4/2018 replaces Circular 2/2015; and
 - (vi) Circular X/2019 replaces Circular 4/2018.

The previous rules in Circulars 8/2007, Circular 3/2009, Circular 3/2012, Circular 2/2013 and Circular 2/2015 which have changed are included in Section J of this Circular. Section H discusses the reasons for each of the revisions to the Circulars.

Circular 4/2018 was updated in 2018 for new IFRSs, changes made to IFRSs and Interpretations (IFRICs) between March 2015 and June 2017 excluding IFRS 17 – *Insurance Contracts*.

This circular, Circular X/2019 was updated again in 2019 for a correction to the rules pertaining to IFRS 16 - *Leases*.

- .03 This Circular intends to:
- (i) provide a background to the use of headline earnings in South Africa;
 - (ii) illustrate the link to IFRS and accounting policy choices;
 - (iii) provide definitions of the terms used in calculating headline earnings;
 - (iv) provide rules for calculating headline earnings for every relevant IFRS and IFRIC¹;
 - (v) provide guidance on the calculation of the “per share” number, presentation of comparative headline earnings numbers and the format of the reconciliation of headline earnings;
 - (vi) provide sector-specific rules where necessary; and
 - (vii) provide the basis for conclusions for decisions made in this circular.

¹ The detailed rules per relevant IFRS/IFRIC address standards and interpretations issued as at 30 June 2017 excluding IFRS 17. This list will be updated as and when necessary.

SECTION A: BACKGROUND**Background to the use of headline earnings in South Africa**

- .04 The focus of most IFRSs is on the recognition of assets and liabilities. Some may argue that this approach results in performance being assessed largely as the difference between two statements of financial positions and not as a stand-alone profit or loss figure. In addition, some standards require gains and losses to be recognised directly in other comprehensive income and then, in some instances, reclassified to profit or loss at a later stage. This means that not all gains and losses are necessarily recognised in the reported net profit figure, or that some gains and losses are not recognised in the period in which they arise.
- .05 The International Accounting Standards Board (IASB) is of the view that there is no single number that encapsulates the performance of an entity. Investors and analysts worldwide have expressed this view for some time. The market takes note of a wider information set. Nevertheless, there is still the call from users for a single earnings number that can be used as an unambiguous reference point.
- .06 The headline earnings survey carried out by SAICA in 2006 and subsequent interviews with various user groups, including fund managers, analysts and financial institutions, showed a large demand from users in general for a clearly defined reference number (other than the earnings per share number in terms of IAS 33 – *Earnings per Share*), which can be used for reporting and comparative purposes.
- .07 One of the main uses of a single earnings number in South Africa is in the calculation of a consistent price earnings (P/E) ratio. A P/E ratio is a useful analysis tool for comparing the market ratings of companies and for trend analysis of the valuations of companies and sectors over time, even though the earnings of the various companies are not necessarily calculated using the same accounting policies. The P/E ratio can also be considered as the number of years' earnings, calculated on a consistent basis, that are represented by the current share price. The linking of the share price to earnings can be difficult to apply to the re-measurement² of assets and liabilities, as markets that drive these re-measurements fluctuate, thus removing the element of consistency. There are inherent difficulties in determining a standard basis for calculating maintainable earnings, and headline earnings is not intended to be representative of maintainable earnings. The use of P/E ratios is not limited to the less sophisticated private investor; these ratios are also used by sophisticated institutional investors worldwide.
- .08 Some believe that a meaningful P/E ratio should use the earnings items that relate to the operating/trading of an entity and not those items (such as the revaluation of certain assets) that relate to the capital platform of the business. The operating/trading items are essentially those that reflect performance in the current period (revenue, salaries, etc.) and that can be extrapolated (modified or not) into the future.
- .09 Not all re-measurements should, however, be ignored. Those relating to working capital are of an operating/trading nature; for example, any impairment of the carrying value of inventories or fair value adjustments relating to a portfolio of securities held-for-trading. These re-measurements are part of an entity's operating/trading activities and should legitimately be included in an earnings number used for the calculation of a P/E ratio.

² Refer to the definitions in paragraph .14.

- .10 These considerations point to the need for continuing to require disclosure of an additional, adjusted earnings per share number to supplement the IAS 33 earnings per share number.

Headline earnings and IFRS, including accounting policy choices

- .11 SAICA and the JSE are fully supportive of IFRS as issued by the IASB. Full compliance with IFRS is of paramount importance for the integrity of South African financial markets within the context of a global equities market.
- .12 Headline earnings should not be seen as a divergence or departure from the recognition criteria for revenue, expenses, gains and losses in IFRS. Instead, it is a way of dividing the IFRS reported profit between re-measurements that are more closely aligned to the operating/trading activities of the entity, and the platform used to create those results. Headline earnings, based on these principles, have been used in South Africa since 1995.
- .13 Headline earnings is not a means for an entity to adjust its financial results for disagreements it might have with the application of IFRS or to circumvent the correct accounting treatment. The starting point for headline earnings is the earnings number used to calculate basic earnings per share, in accordance with IAS 33. Accordingly, if items were excluded from basic earnings, they would also be excluded from headline earnings. For this reason, accounting policy choices that affect basic earnings would also impact headline earnings.

SECTION B: DEFINITIONS

- .14 The following definitions are used within the context of this circular.

Headline earnings are an additional earnings number that is permitted by IAS 33. The starting point is earnings as determined in IAS 33, excluding “*separately identifiable re-measurements*” (as defined), net of related tax (both current and deferred) and related non-controlling interest, other than re-measurements specifically included in headline earnings (“*included re-measurements*”, as defined).

A **re-measurement** is an amount recognised in profit or loss relating to any change (whether realised or unrealised) in the carrying amount of an asset or liability that arose after the initial recognition of such asset or liability. A re-measurement may be recognised in profit or loss either when the re-measurement occurs or subsequently. This latter situation occurs when re-measurements are initially recorded in other comprehensive income (in accordance with the relevant IFRS) and subsequently included in or reclassified to profit or loss. For example, foreign exchange translation gains or losses under IAS 21 – *The Effects of Changes in Foreign Exchange Rates*.

A re-measurement can, by definition, never be:

- i) the initial recognition of an asset or liability at fair value; or
- ii) the expensing of a cost that fails to meet the definition of an asset; or
- iii) a gain recognised in other comprehensive income, such as a revaluation gain on property, plant and equipment, which is not reclassified to profit or loss.

Included re-measurements are the re-measurements identified in the table in paragraph .21 (Section C) of this circular and are to be included in headline earnings because:

- (i) they have been determined as normally relating to the operating/trading activities of the entity;
- (ii) they relate to the usage (as reflected by depreciation) of a non-current asset, which is an operating/trading activity of the entity;
- (iii) they relate to current assets or current liabilities, and thus relate to the operating/trading activities of the entity (other than current assets or liabilities as part of a disposal group within the measurement scope³ of IFRS 5 – *Non-current Assets Held for Sale and Discontinued Operations*);
- (iv) they are foreign exchange movements on monetary assets and liabilities and thus relate to the operating/trading activities of the entity, except for those relating to foreign operations that were previously recognised in other comprehensive income and subsequently reclassified to profit or loss. This exception also applies to the translation differences of loans or receivables that form part of such net investment in a foreign operation;
- (v) they are financial instrument adjustments arising from the application of IAS 39 (whether as the result of revaluation, impairment or amortisation), except for all reclassified gains and losses other than those detailed in (vi) below. For example, gains or losses on available-for-sale financial assets that are reclassified to profit or loss on disposal or impairment of the financial asset are excluded from headline earnings because the reclassified fair value gains and losses do not only reflect performance in the current period; or
- (vi) they are reclassified items relating to IAS 39 cash-flow hedges because these amounts are matched with those relating to the hedged item.
- (vii) they are financial instrument adjustments arising from the application of IFRS 9 (whether as the result of revaluation, impairment or amortisation), except for all reclassified gains and losses for a hedge of a net investment in a foreign operation.

Reclassification (or reclassification adjustments) occurs when re-measurements are initially recorded in other comprehensive income (in accordance with the relevant IFRS) and are subsequently recycled or reclassified to profit or loss. This is referred to as a “**reclassified gain or loss item**”.

Separately identifiable re-measurements are those where the applicable IFRS explicitly requires separate disclosure of the operating/trading and/or the platform re-measurement in the separate or individual financial statements of the entity/company/subsidiary/associate/joint venture/joint operation or in the consolidated financial statements. No adjustments would be permitted on the basis of voluntary disclosure of gains or losses (or components of these).

³ Refer to IFRS 5, paragraph 5, for those assets not within the measurement scope of IFRS 5. It must be noted that financial assets within the scope of IAS 39 are not within the measurement scope of IFRS 5. Section C of this circular indicates that impairment losses recognised in respect of disposal groups in terms of IFRS 5, paragraphs 20 – 24, are excluded re-measurements.

The interested parties group includes members of SAICA, the Investment Analysts Society of Southern Africa (IASSA), the Investment Managers Association of South Africa (IMASA) and the headline earnings sub-committee of the United Kingdom Society of Investment Professionals.

Operating⁴/trading activities are those activities that are carried out using the “platform”, including the cost associated with financing those activities.

The **platform** is the capital⁴ base of the entity. Capital transactions reflect and affect the resources committed in producing operating/trading performance and are not the performance itself.

SECTION C: DETAILED RULES FOR HEADLINE EARNINGS

- .15 In terms of Section 8 of the JSE Listings Requirements, headline earnings and diluted headline earnings should be disclosed with a detailed reconciliation to the IAS 33 basic earnings number. In terms of the Listings Requirements, the auditors have an obligation to modify their audit opinion for non-compliance with the headline earnings circular.
- .16 IAS 33, paragraph 73, allows disclosure of additional performance numbers in the notes to the annual financial statements. IAS 33, paragraph 73 states that “*basic and diluted amounts per share relating to such a component shall be disclosed with equal prominence and presented in the notes to the financial statements*”.

Calculation of headline earnings

- .17 Headline earnings is calculated by starting with the basic earnings number in terms of IAS 33 and then excluding all re-measurements that have been identified in this section (Section C) as relating to the platform of the entity. The focus on re-measurements (whether realised or unrealised), as opposed to capital items, in Circular 7/2002, provides a clearer and more consistent mechanism for determining headline earnings in the context of IFRS.
- .18 The main purpose for reconsidering the calculation of headline earnings in 2007 was to ensure consistency of treatment by all companies listed on the JSE of the same or similar items. The only way to achieve this consistency is to create detailed rules for all items that are separately disclosable in terms of IFRS.
- .19 Any deviation from the rules would result in undesirable inconsistencies. Companies are therefore not permitted to override a rule even if they believe that the operating/trading and platform distinction set out in the rules is inappropriate for their specific business. The sector-specific rules section of this circular has been created to allow for an alternative treatment for an entire sector where the general rule is inappropriate to its business. The “Basis for Conclusions” section merely provides background information and guidelines that were used to formulate the calculation of headline earnings and is not to be used to override any of the rules.
- .20 The table below identifies items that are separately identifiable re-measurements (or that might mistakenly be regarded as re-measurements), and indicates whether each of these items

⁴ The meanings of the words “*operating*” and “*capital*” in this circular are different from their meanings in IFRS.

is included or excluded from headline earnings. This analysis has been conducted per individual IFRS, is based on all IFRSs and Interpretations issued as at June 2017 and provides the reasoning behind the decision to include or exclude the items. These reasons relate to the definitions set out in Section B of this circular. In many instances the reason for exclusion is that the amount is a re-measurement that has not been specifically included. This is simply referred to as a “re-measurement”. The table does not include IFRSs or Interpretations where no re-measurements were identified, in which case all items from those IFRSs or Interpretations are included in headline earnings.

Detailed rules table per IFRS

- .21 An entity is to apply the table set out in this paragraph (.21). To clarify the symbols:
- Rules in this table marked with Δ are different from rules in Circular 3/2012;
 - Any rules marked with \square are rules for new IFRSs and Interpretations issued after the issue of Circular 3/2012. Changes to Circular 3/2012 dealt largely with changes to the standards issued since 2009. A few other changes were made in order to remove uncertainty that existed in the market place and include:
 - IFRS 5 where there is a change in a plan with regard to an asset or group of assets held for sale; IAS 17 which has been added for completeness. (Standards dealing with disclosure issues alone have not been added to the rule table);
 - IFRIC 1, IFRIC 18 and SIC 25 have been added for completeness because these Interpretations deal with re-measurements not already included in the underlying standard (Interpretations dealing with disclosure issues alone have not been added to the rule table); and
 - IAS 16/IAS 38 for the subsequent measurement of the compensation receivable.
 - Rules in this table marked with \bigcirc are different from rules in Circular 2/2013.
 - Rules in this table marked with \boxtimes are different from rules in Circular 2/2015.
 - Rules in this table marked with \boxplus are different from rules in Circular 4/2018.

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IFRS 2	<i>Share-based Payment</i>	X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If the receipt of goods or services does not qualify for capitalisation under IFRS, the amount recognised in earnings is not a re-measurement. Thus, black economic empowerment transactions are included in headline earnings. Similarly, consumption of the benefits embodied in the receipt of services under a share-based payment transaction is not a re-measurement. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined. The re-measurements of
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The recognition in basic earnings of the receipt of goods or services from share-based payment transactions. 			
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Re-measurements of cash-settled share- 	X		

HEADLINE EARNINGS

**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
	based payment transactions.			cash-settled share-based payment transactions relate to the financing of the acquisition of goods or services.
IFRS 3 Δ	<p><i>Business Combinations</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goodwill impairment. • The recognised gain from a bargain purchase. • Transaction costs. • Subsequent re-measurement of contingent liabilities. • Subsequent amortisation of reacquired rights. • Subsequent re-measurement of contingent consideration (Note: there is no re-measurement if it is equity classified). • Gains or losses on deemed disposals in terms of paragraph 42 where the disposal is of an asset previously accounted for as a: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Joint venture -Associate -IAS 39/IFRS 9 financial asset at fair value through profit or loss -IAS 39 financial asset classified as an available-for-sale. <p>(Note: IFRS 9 investments in equity instruments included in other comprehensive income – these are not recognised in profit or loss, therefore they do not affect headline earnings).</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">X X X X</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">X X X X X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Re-measurement. • In order to align the treatment with goodwill, it is treated on the same basis. • Not a re-measurement. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined. • Included re-measurement (ii) as defined. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined. • Re-measurement is dealt with in terms of the normal rules for a gain or loss on disposal.
IFRS 4	<p><i>Insurance Contracts</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Liability adequacy test. • Impairment of reinsurance assets. • Paragraph 31(b) amortisation and impairment. • Paragraph 15 deferred acquisition costs (amortisation and impairment). 	<p style="text-align: center;">X X X X</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (i) as defined. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined.

HEADLINE EARNINGS

**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IFRS 9 <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="radio"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Financial Instruments (effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2018)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All re-measurements through profit or loss. • The reclassification of any re-measurements from other comprehensive income to profit or loss. • Except for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The reclassification of other comprehensive income to profit or loss, for a hedge of a net investment in a foreign operation. <p>(Note: IFRS 9 investments in equity instruments included in other comprehensive income – these are not recognised in profit or loss, therefore they do not affect headline earnings).</p> <p><i>Hedge accounting under IAS 39</i></p> <p>Entities have the option to continue to apply the hedge accounting requirements in IAS 39 after IFRS 9 becomes effective. The rules applicable in those instances are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All re-measurements recognised in profit or loss; • Including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - amounts recognised in profit or loss under cash-flow hedges that were previously recognised directly in other comprehensive income. • The reclassification of re-measurements from other comprehensive income to profit or loss, relating to a hedge of a net investment in a foreign operation. 	<p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (vii) as defined. • Included re-measurement (vii) as defined. • Excluded re-measurement (vii) as defined. • Included re-measurement (v) as defined. • Included re-measurement (vi) as defined. • Excluded re-measurement (v) as defined.
IFRS 10 <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Consolidated Financial Statements</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gains/losses on the loss of control of a subsidiary. <p>(Note: Investment entities (as defined by IFRS 10) with an investment in a subsidiary carried at fair value should refer to IAS 39/IFRS 9's headline earnings' requirements).</p>		<p style="text-align: center;">X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Re-measurement.

HEADLINE EARNINGS

Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IFRS 11 <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Joint Arrangements</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Re-measurements of assets and liabilities recognised in relation to joint operations should be dealt with in terms of the detailed rules applicable to the IFRSs relevant to each specific item. Re-measurement related to interests in joint ventures should be dealt with in terms of the detailed rules applicable to the IFRS that has been applied. For example, IAS 28 if equity accounted or IFRS 9 or IAS 39 if recognised at fair value through profit or loss. <p>(Note: The impact of the transition to IFRS 11 does not impact headline earnings as it is not included in profit or loss).</p>			
IFRS 15 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Revenue from Contracts with Customers (effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2018)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> All remeasurements recognised through profit or loss. 	X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Included re-measurements (ii) and (vii) as defined.
IFRS 16 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Leases (effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2019)</i></p> <p><i>Lessees</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Depreciation – right-of-use asset. Impairment/subsequent reversal of impairment of the right-of-use asset <p>(Note 1: Gains on revaluation of right-of-use will not be included in headline earnings because they are not included in profit or loss.)</p> <p>(Note 2: Remeasurements of the right-of-use-asset classified as investment property should be dealt with in terms of headline earnings requirements applicable to IAS 40).</p>	X	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Included re-measurement (ii) as defined. Re-measurement of an asset.

HEADLINE EARNINGS

**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
	<p>(Note 3: Items not detailed above are not re-measurements and therefore have not been dealt with.)</p> <p><i>Lessors</i></p> <p>All remeasurements included in profit or loss.</p> <p>Except for: Operating lease</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impairment/subsequent reversal of impairment of the underlying non-financial asset. <p>Sale and leaseback Transfer of the asset is a sale</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gain or loss arising from rights transferred to the buyer/lessor (The same rules apply as for the disposal of property, plant and equipment). 	<p>X</p>	<p>X</p> <p>X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (ii), (v) and (vii) as defined. • Remeasurement of an asset • Remeasurement of an asset
IAS 2	<p><i>Inventories</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Re-measurements in terms of this standard. • Write down or reversal of write down to net realisable value (paragraph 34). 	<p>X</p> <p>X</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (i) as defined. • Included re-measurement (i) and (iii) as defined.
IAS 12	<p><i>Income Taxes</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increases or decreases in the deferred tax balance resulting from the use of a different tax rate. For example, a change in the corporate income tax rate, or a change in the inclusion rate for capital gains or a change in that tax rate due to a change in the manner in which the entity expects to recover or settle the carrying amount of its assets and liabilities. • Except for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Changes in the deferred tax balance resulting from the use of a different tax rate that relates to items that were excluded from headline earnings in the current or prior period(s). 	<p>X</p>	<p>X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (i) as defined. • Tax effects of items excluded from headline earnings are also excluded.

HEADLINE EARNINGS
**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
	<p>(Note: Changes in the deferred tax balance that do not affect profit or loss are not included in headline earnings as these changes are not included in basic earnings.)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gain arising from the recognition of deferred tax asset resulting from an assessed loss: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Initial recognition. • Reassessment of recoverability of deferred tax assets. 	<p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not a re-measurement. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined, as this is dependent on future profits.
IAS 16 Δ	<p><i>Property, Plant and Equipment</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depreciation. • Impairment/subsequent reversal of impairment. • Disposal gains/losses. • Compensation from third parties for items of property, plant and equipment that were impaired, lost or given up (initial recognition). • Subsequent measurement of the compensation receivable from third parties for items of property, plant and equipment that were impaired, lost or given up: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Due to the unwinding of the discount as a result of the time value of money. - All other changes. <p>(Note 1: Gains on revaluation of property, plant and equipment will not be included in headline earnings because they are not included in profit or loss.)</p> <p>(Note 2: Gains and losses on sale of assets previously held for rental, now transferred to inventory in terms of IAS 16 paragraph 68A, should be dealt with in terms of IAS 2.)</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (ii) as defined. • Re-measurement of an asset. • Re-measurement of an asset. • Re-measurement of an asset. • Included re-measurement (vi) as defined, because it is dealt with in terms of IAS 39/IFRS 9. • Re-measurement of an asset.
IAS 19 Δ ☒	<p><i>Employee Benefits</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All re-measurements recognised through profit or loss. 	<p style="text-align: center;">X</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (i) as defined, as they are part of the employee benefit costs and therefore operating/trading activities as defined.

HEADLINE EARNINGS
**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IAS 20	<i>Accounting for Government Grants and Disclosure of Government Assistance</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> All government grants. 	X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not a re-measurement.
IAS 21	<i>The Effects of Changes in Foreign Exchange Rates</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Translation of monetary assets/liabilities (whether current or non-current) other than those treated as part of the net investment in a foreign operation. Translation of the net investment in a foreign operation and monetary assets/liabilities treated as part of the net investment accounted for initially in other comprehensive income (in the foreign currency translation reserve) and subsequently reclassified to profit or loss. 	X	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Included re-measurement (iv) as defined. Re-measurement.
IAS 27 Δ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<i>Separate Financial Statements</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gains/losses on the loss of control of the subsidiary. <p>(Note: Entities with an investment in an associate or joint venture that is carried at fair value should refer to IAS 39/IFRS 9's headline earnings requirements).</p>		X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Re-measurement of an asset.
IAS 28 Δ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<i>Investments in Associates and Joint Ventures</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gains/losses on the disposal of the associate/joint venture The equity-accounted earnings of associates and joint ventures. <p>(Note: Entities with an investment in an associate or joint venture that is carried at fair value should refer to IAS 39/IFRS 9's headline earnings requirements).</p>		X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Re-measurement of an asset. The rules contained in this table apply equally to the underlying earnings of the associate. For example, the gain on disposal of non-current asset (or property plant and equipment) by an associate is excluded from headline earnings, i.e. the "look-through" approach is followed.
IAS 29	<i>Financial Reporting in Hyperinflationary Economies</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gain or loss on the net monetary position. 	X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Included re-measurement (i) as defined.

HEADLINE EARNINGS

Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IAS 36	<p><i>Impairment of Assets</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Any impairment/subsequent reversal of an impairment covered in this standard. <p>(Note: The scope of IAS 36 excludes items that are likely to be classified as current assets.)</p>		X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Re-measurement of an asset.
IAS 37	<p><i>Provisions, Contingent Liabilities and Contingent Assets</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Any adjustments or re-measurements recognised in profit or loss in terms of this standard. 	X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (i) as defined.
IAS 38	<p><i>Intangible Assets</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Amortisation. • Impairment/subsequent reversal of impairment. • Disposal gains/losses. • Compensation from third parties for intangible assets that were impaired, lost or given up (initial recognition). • Subsequent measurement of compensation receivable from third parties for items of intangible assets that were impaired, lost or given up: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Due to the unwinding of the discount as a result of the time value of money. - All other changes. <p>(Note: The revaluation of an intangible asset is not included in basic earnings and is therefore automatically excluded from headline earnings.)</p>	X	<p>X</p> <p>X</p> <p>X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (ii) as defined. • Re-measurement of an asset. • Re-measurement of an asset. • Re-measurement of an asset
IAS 40 Δ	<p><i>Investment Property</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gain or loss recognised from a transfer from inventory to investment property. • Re-measurements to fair value at date of transfer from investment property to another category of asset in terms of paragraph 57. • Any other adjustments/ re-measurements in terms of this standard. 	X	<p>X</p> <p>X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (i) as defined. • Re-measurement of an asset. • Re-measurement of an asset.

HEADLINE EARNINGS

Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IAS 41	<p><i>Agriculture</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> All re-measurements in terms of the standard. <p>(Note: As separate disclosure is not required of the fair value measurement changes of the agricultural platform, the full amount is included in headline earnings.)</p>	X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Included re-measurement (i) as defined.
IFRIC 1 Δ	<p><i>Changes in Existing Decommissioning, Restoration and Similar Liabilities</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reduction in the decommissioning, restoration, or similar liability that exceeds the carrying amount of an item of property, plant and equipment and is recognised in profit or loss. 	X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Included re-measurement (i) as defined.
IFRIC 17	<p><i>Distributions of non-cash assets to owners</i></p> <p>The effect of such a distribution is the same as a disposal of the underlying. The headline earnings treatment therefore follows the same treatment as if there were a disposal.</p>			
SIC 25Δ	<p><i>Income Taxes – Changes in the Tax Status of an Entity or its Shareholders</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Current and deferred tax consequences arising from a change in the tax status included in profit or loss. <p>- Except to the extent that they relate to items excluded from headline earnings in the current or prior period(s).</p>	X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Included re-measurement (i) as defined. Follows the same treatment as under IAS 12.
			X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tax effects of items excluded from headline earnings are also excluded.

.22 For the items marked with Δ, ○, ☒, ☑ the previous version of the rule table from Circular 3/2012, Circular 2/2013, Circular 2/2015 or Circular 4/2018 is set out in Section J of this circular.

SECTION D: THE PRESENTATION OF HEADLINE EARNINGS PER SHARE

Diluted headline earnings

.23 Diluted headline earnings is the headline earnings calculated in terms of the rules, adjusted for exactly the same adjustments as those made to basic earnings when calculating diluted earnings per share. This implies that, if a potential ordinary share is considered to be dilutive in terms of IAS 33, it should be adjusted when calculating diluted headline earnings per share, even if that adjustment does not dilute headline earnings.

Number of shares

- .24 The number of shares to be used in calculating the headline earnings per share must be the same as the number used to calculate basic earnings per share in terms of IAS 33. Similarly, the number used to calculate the diluted headline earnings per share must be the same as that used to calculate the diluted earnings per share in terms of IAS 33.

Comparative headline earnings

- .25 Headline earnings per share must be presented for each financial period for which basic earnings per share is presented. The comparative number for headline earnings per share may change as a result of retrospective adjustments to the number of shares in issue in terms of the requirements of paragraph 64 of IAS 33. It may also differ where the earnings number used for basic earnings per share has been restated, as that number is the starting point in the calculation for headline earnings.
- .26 As a result of issuing circulars to supersede previous circulars, previously reported headline earnings are required to be restated in accordance with the requirements of the most recently issued circular. There must therefore be a restatement of comparative headline earnings if the calculation of headline earnings is not in accordance with the changed rules contained in this circular.

Format of the headline earnings reconciliation

- .27 The headline earnings reconciliation must be separate and must not form part of the statement of profit or loss and other comprehensive income. The headline earnings reconciliation must be based on the earnings number and not on a “per share” basis. Headline earnings per share, with this reconciliation, must be disclosed in the notes to the financial statements.
- .28 A long form of the headline earnings reconciliation is to be included in the annual financial statements. This long form requires disclosure of the gross and net amount of each re-measurement to be excluded from headline earnings. The total of the related tax and the non-controlling interest amounts for each re-measurement can be determined by deduction. Consideration must be given to disclosing the tax and the non-controlling interest of each re-measurement if material and beneficial to users. A short form of the reconciliation may be used in interim, preliminary, provisional and abridged reports.

The short-form reconciliation only requires disclosure of the gross amount of each re-measurement adjustment and does not require separate disclosure of the related tax and the non-controlling interest amounts of each adjustment. Instead, the related tax and the non-controlling interest amounts are each shown in aggregate for all of the re-measurement adjustments. When using the short-form reconciliation, consideration must be given to providing additional commentary, for users to be able to understand the related tax and the non-controlling interest amounts.

- .29 The starting point for the reconciliation is profit or loss attributable to the ordinary equity holders of the parent. IAS 33, paragraph 73, states that: “*If a component of the statement of*

comprehensive income is used that is not reported as a line item in the statement of comprehensive income, a reconciliation shall be provided between the component used and a line item that is reported in the statement of comprehensive income.” A detailed line-by-line reconciliation should be provided for each re-measurement to be excluded from headline earnings. The long-form reconciliation should have two columns showing the gross amount and the net amount for each re-measurement. The short-form reconciliation will only have one column. Excluded re-measurements can be aggregated per type of re-measurement per IFRS, unless any such re-measurement is material within the context of the total adjustments. An example is provided below for both the long-form and the short-form reconciliations.

.30 **Example of the long-form headline earnings reconciliation**

	Gross	Net
Profit attributable to ordinary equity holders of the parent entity		XX
Less undeclared cumulative preference share dividend and related taxation		<u>(XX)</u>
IAS 33 earnings		XX
Less IAS 16 gains on the disposal of land and buildings	(XX)	(XX)
Less IAS 16 gains on the disposal of plant and equipment	(XX)	(XX)
Plus IAS 38 impairment of trademarks	XX	XX
Less the re-measurements included in equity-accounted earnings of associates (1)(2)	(XX)	<u>(XX)</u>
Headline earnings		<u>XX</u>

.31 **Example of the short-form headline earnings reconciliation**

Profit attributable to ordinary equity holders of the parent entity	XX
Less undeclared cumulative preference share dividends and relative taxation	<u>(XX)</u>
IAS 33 earnings	XX
Less IAS 16 gains on the disposal of land and buildings (3)	(XX)
Less IAS 16 gains on the disposal of plant and equipment (3)	(XX)
Plus IAS 38 impairment of trademarks (3)	XX
Less the re-measurements included in equity-accounted earnings of associates (1)(3)	(XX)
Total tax effects of adjustments	XX
Total non-controlling interest effects of adjustments	<u>XX</u>
Headline earnings	<u>XX</u>

- (1) *If material, an analysis must be given of the different types of re-measurements for the equity-accounted earnings.*
- (2) *If it is impossible to obtain the actual tax amount from the associate, this fact should be stated and details of any assumption made in determining the tax should be provided.*
- (3) *These are the gross amounts, before taking account of the related tax and non-controlling interest.*

SECTION E: HEADLINE EARNINGS PER LINKED UNIT

- .32 In certain instances, an entity must disclose headline earnings per linked unit instead of headline earnings per share. Linked units are a common feature of the property sector of the JSE where a share and a debenture trade as a linked unit.
- .33 Headline earnings, calculated in terms of this circular, is the starting point for headline earnings attributable to linked unit holders, and the detailed reconciliation between earnings and headline earnings must still be provided. Further adjustments must then be made and disclosed in the reconciliation, for items in profit and loss that are attributable to the other instrument (typically a debenture) that, together with the share, forms part of the linked unit.

- .34 When a debenture forms the other component of the linked unit, the additional adjustments are as follows:
- (i) add interest paid to debenture holders (as this is the net income attributable to the debentures, which are part of the linked units); and
 - (ii) add/deduct any IAS 39 or IFRS 9 adjustments on the debenture (as these relate to the debentures that are part of the linked units) such as:
 - amortised cost adjustment where the entity measures the debentures (financial liabilities) at amortised cost after initial recognition; and
 - fair value adjustments where the entity has designated the debentures (financial liabilities) at fair value through profit and loss.
- .35 The headline earnings attributable to the linked unit holders is divided by the number of linked units to determine the per linked unit number. The number of linked units used must be calculated on the same basis as set out in IAS 33 for earnings per share.

SECTION F: EFFECTIVE DATE

- .36 Circular 3/2009 replaced Circular 8/2007 and subject to the requirement that the changes were effective when that specific revised IFRS was applied by the entity, the circular was effective for financial periods (interim and/or annual periods) ending on or after 31 August 2009. Early adoption was permitted. If an entity had not yet applied the amended or revised IFRSs they had to use the previous rule set out in Circular 8/2007..37 Circular 3/2012 replaced Circular 3/2009 and was effective for financial periods (interim and/or annual periods) ending on or after 31 July 2012. Early adoption was permitted.
- .38 Circular 2/2013 replaced Circular 3/2012 and was effective for financial periods (interim and/or annual periods) ending on or after 31 July 2013. Early adoption was permitted. If an entity had not yet applied the new, amended, revised IFRSs or new Interpretations, they also had to use previous rules set out in the detailed rules table in paragraph .108 will apply.
- .39 Circular 2/2015 replaced Circular 2/2013 and is effective for financial periods (interim and/or annual periods) ending on or after 31 October 2015. If an entity has not yet applied the new, amended, revised IFRSs or new Interpretations, the previous rules set out in the detailed rules table in paragraph .109 will also apply. Early adoption is permitted.
- .40 Circular 4/2018 replaces Circular 2/2015 and is effective for financial periods (interim and/or annual periods) ending on or after 30 April 2018. Early adoption is permitted. If an entity has not yet applied the new, amended IFRSs or new Interpretations, the previous rules set out in the detailed rules table in paragraph .110 will also apply.
- .41 Circular X/2019 replaces Circular 4/2018 and is effective for financial periods (interim and/or annual periods) ending on or after 31 December 2019. This is meant to coincide with the first-time adoption of IFRS 16 *Leases*.

SECTION G: CREATION OF SECTOR-SPECIFIC RULES FOR HEADLINE EARNINGS

- .42 If a specific industry is of the view that a particular rule within the headline earnings formula is inappropriate for that industry, it should make representation to the JSE on the matter. The JSE will, in consultation with the interested parties group (as defined), decide if a rule should be written for that entire industry to exclude or include that specific re-measurement. As the underlying objective is to ensure consistency between companies within a sector, representation should only be made with the full support of the sector.

The final decision will be made on the basis of the rationale to treat separately identifiable re-measurements in a particular sector in a different manner from that outlined above, considering any potential implications for other sectors and with the objective of avoiding any potential risk of undermining IFRS. If necessary and when appropriate, Section I of the circular will be updated to address these industry-specific issues. Such rules will be industry specific and may not, by analogy, be applied by industries other than those for which the rules are developed.

SECTION H: BASIS FOR CONCLUSIONS

- .43 This section sets out the basis for conclusions in developing the rules for headline earnings. Circular 8/2007 was issued by SAICA as Exposure Draft 220 – *Headline Earnings*, at the request of the JSE, in December 2006, with a comment date of 12 March 2007. Paragraphs .52 to .68 of this section include a discussion of certain issues raised by the commentators to the exposure draft and the response to these issues.
- .44 Circular 3/2009 was issued by SAICA at the request of the JSE as Exposure Draft 265. Paragraphs .69 to .75 of this section also includes a discussion of items considered during the drafting of the revisions to Circular 8/2007 as now incorporated in Circular 3/2009. Paragraph .76 includes a discussion of the items considered in drafting the revisions to Circular 3/2009 which was re-issued as Circular 3/2012.
- .45 Circular 2/2013 was issued by SAICA for public comment in June 2013 at the request of the JSE as Exposure Draft 333/2013. Paragraphs .77 to .79 of this section, includes a discussion of the items considered in drafting the revisions to Circular 3/2012 as now incorporated in Circular 2/2013.
- .46 Circular 2/2015 was issued by SAICA for public comment in July 2015 at the request of the JSE as Exposure Draft 359/2015. Paragraph 80 of this section, includes a discussion of the items considered in drafting the revisions to Circular 2/2013 as now incorporated in Circular 2/2015.
- .47 Circular 4/2018 was issued by SAICA for public comment in December 2017 at the request of the JSE as Exposure Draft 383/2018. Paragraphs .81 to .84 of this section, includes a discussion of the items considered in drafting the revisions to Circular 2/2015 as now incorporated in Circular 4/2018.
- .48 Circular X/2019 was issued by SAICA for public comment in November 2019 at the request of the JSE as Exposure Draft 402/2019. Paragraphs .85 to .86 of this section, includes a

discussion of the items considered in drafting the revisions to Circular 4/2018 as now incorporated in Circular X/2019.

Distinction between re-measurements and operating/trading

- .49 To be meaningful, the P/E ratio should be based on an earnings number that reflects the underlying operating/trading performance of an entity and should be calculated consistently between entities and over time. Several developments in the financial world (for example, increased use and complexity of derivative instruments) and the consequential accounting treatment, as well as the approach of the IASB to focus on the statement of financial position, have, however, blurred the distinction between capital and income. These developments have also blurred the platform versus operating/trading distinction, developed in the original headline earnings formula of 1995, as contained in the SAICA Circular 7/2002, and make it increasingly difficult to apply the platform versus operating/trading principles consistently.
- .50 Recognition of changes in value (re-measurements in IASB terms) in profit or loss has increased as the IASB moves more to a fair value accounting approach. The increase in re-measurements increases the possibility of volatility of an entity's performance numbers. The exclusion of (most) re-measurements (other than those, for example, stemming from operating/trading) parallels in most cases the original headline earnings distinction between platform and operating/trading. This provides ongoing justification for the original principle and validates the continued use of the currently published historic headline earnings data without interruption. This has significant value for time-series analysis, especially over several economic cycles.
- .51 In view of the mixed attribute (cost/fair value) model in IFRS, especially in IAS 39 – *Financial Instruments: Recognition and Measurement* and its replacement standard, IFRS 9 – *Financial Instruments*, the distinction between the platform and operating/trading mentioned above may sometimes be difficult to make. In some cases this difficulty, and/or the practical considerations involved, may result in headline earnings being based on an accounting treatment that may appear contradictory to the headline earnings principle of distinguishing between the platform and operating/trading. Such imperfections have to be accepted if a headline earnings is going to achieve the objective of creating a single earnings number that is consistently calculated.

Specific adjustments considered when issuing Circular 8/2007

- .52 Respondents to the SAICA headline earnings research undertaken in 2006 indicated a desire for the following issues to be addressed in a headline earnings revision, because of the problems these issues cause in practice:
- (i) fair value adjustments;
 - (ii) foreign exchange gains and losses;
 - (iii) amortisation of intangible assets;
 - (iv) black economic empowerment (BEE) transactions;
 - (v) effect of straight-lining of operating lease payments; and
 - (vi) secondary tax on companies (STC) on dividends.

Items (i) to (iii) have been specifically dealt with in the rule table. This should ensure consistency of treatment. The initial recognition of items (iv) to (vi) is not a re-measurement and these items would therefore be included in headline earnings.

- .53 As the starting point for the calculation of headline earnings is the IAS 33 earnings number, items not recognised in this earnings number cannot be included in headline earnings. This would include gains on revaluation of property, plant and equipment and fair value gains or losses on available-for-sale financial assets that are recognised in other comprehensive income.
- .54 An argument was made during the comment process that in certain BEE transactions the IFRS 2 expense is part of the gain or loss on disposal of a business and should therefore be excluded from headline earnings. BEE credentials are capable of being obtained in a number of ways, including disposing of a business or issuing options or shares at a discount, and in many cases the legal form of the transaction is different from the economic substance. In addition many transactions involve the receipt of services from BEE employees. In order to ensure consistent treatment of BEE transactions from a headline earnings perspective, the decision taken was to include the IFRS 2 charge in headline earnings, as other IFRS 2 charges are included in headline earnings.

The impact of accounting policy choices on headline earnings

- .55 The application of IFRS can result in different accounting treatments, depending on the accounting policies adopted and, in the case of financial instruments, the initial designation of such instruments. These choices should be borne in mind from an operating/trading versus platform point of view, as a specific accounting policy choice may imply a certain intention and has the potential to affect headline earnings differently. Accounting policy choices affect earnings, which affect the IAS 33 earnings per share and therefore headline earnings per share (as headline earnings is based on earnings used for earnings per share); these accounting policy choices cannot be “fixed” in the headline earnings calculation.
- .56 Examples of accounting policy choices that affect income include the initial designation of financial instruments in terms of IAS 39 – *Financial Instruments: Recognition and Measurement*, which can result in re-measurements going initially to other comprehensive income as opposed to profit or loss. A further example arises under IAS 19 – *Employee Benefits*, where an entity can elect to recognise actuarial gains or losses within profit and loss or outside of profit or loss and in other comprehensive income.

The choice to take the actuarial gains or losses to profit or loss includes these gains or losses within headline earnings, while the choice to reflect them in other comprehensive income excludes them from headline earnings. Another example is the application of IFRS 6 – *Exploration for and Evaluation of Mineral Resources*. Some mining companies expense exploration and evaluation costs as incurred, which will include these costs within headline earnings, while others capitalise these costs, which will initially exclude these costs from headline earnings. The amortisation of these costs would be included in headline earnings.

Treatment of IAS 39 re-measurements

- .57 When dealing with IAS 39 re-measurements, there are practical difficulties in determining which re-measurements relate to the platform and which relate to operating/trading activities. The four options that were considered were:
- (i) include all IAS 39 re-measurements (recognised in earnings⁵) in headline earnings;
 - (ii) exclude all IAS 39 re-measurements (recognised in earnings⁵) from headline earnings;
 - (iii) include all IAS 39 re-measurements (recognised in earnings⁵) in headline earnings, but exclude all reclassification items other than cash-flow hedges; or
 - (iv) exclude some IAS 39 re-measurements in headline earnings, based on management's intentions.
- .58 Options (i) to (iii) are essentially arbitrary rules, while option (iv) would allow entities to make their own distinction. While options (i) to (iii) each have their detractors, option (iv) is the most problematic, as it would not result in consistency between companies, which is one of the underlying objectives of headline earnings. This circular follows option (iii), which was considered to be the most objective and robust approach for achieving the purpose of headline earnings, and is also consistent with the approach adopted in Circular 7/2002.⁶
- .59 The decision was thus taken that the gains or losses recognised should be dealt with in accordance with the accounting treatment in the financial statements. If the adjustment or gain or loss is initially included in profit or loss, it should be included in headline earnings and vice versa.
- .60 The majority of respondents to the exposure draft agreed that option (iii) was the best way to address IAS 39 in headline earnings.

IAS 39 reclassified re-measurements

- .61 All IAS 39 reclassified re-measurements, other than those relating to cash-flow hedges, are excluded from headline earnings as they do not only relate to the current period. From the specific way that IAS 39 is drafted, re-measurements that relate to the platform of the entity are initially recognised in other comprehensive income. They are not initially recognised in profit or loss as they do not reflect the entity's underlying trading performance. For example, gains or losses on available-for-sale financial assets that are reclassified to profit or loss on disposal or impairment are excluded from headline earnings because all fair value gains and

⁵ As earnings is the starting point for headline earnings.

⁶ Paragraph 22A of Circular 7/2002 stated that "*adjustments to the carrying amounts of financial instruments (whether the result of revaluation, impairment or amortisation) and gains or losses on the realisation thereof should be dealt with in accordance with the accounting treatment in the financial statements. If an adjustment or gain or loss is included in "profit or loss "it should be included in headline earnings, but otherwise excluded. In those instances where fair value adjustments of available-for-sale financial instruments are recognised in "other comprehensive income", but subsequently on disposal or impairment are "reclassified to profit or loss, the reclassified " amount is excluded from headline earnings."*" (Note: certain words within this quote from the 2002 circular were amended in order ensure alignment with the new terminology in IAS 1. The amended words are excluded from the inverted commas and are not in italics.)

losses on available-for-sale financial assets are initially recognised directly in other comprehensive income, and therefore the reclassified amounts do not only reflect performance of the current period.

- .62 The reclassification of cash-flow hedges, on the other hand, is included in headline earnings, as this re-measurement is only temporarily placed in other comprehensive income so that its recognition through profit or loss can be matched to the underlying related hedged item. Headline earnings adjustments can only be made for separately identifiable items. Therefore, while there may be an argument that some of the cash-flow hedges relate to items that form the platform of the business, since there is no requirement to disclose the reclassification adjustments separately per type of cash-flow hedge and given that most of the cash-flow hedges are likely to relate to items that are included in headline earnings, all reclassifications of cash-flow hedges are included in headline earnings.

Separately identifiable re-measurements

- .63 In some cases, the recognised re-measurement adjustments may include elements of both a platform and an operating/trading nature. Only re-measurements where the applicable IFRS explicitly requires separate disclosure of the operating/trading and/or the platform portion of re-measurement in the underlying accounts of the entity/company/subsidiary/associate/ joint venture can be adjusted in headline earnings. To allow entities to determine subjectively which portion of a re-measurement relates to the platform would undermine the objective of headline earnings to ensure consistency across entities. The calculation of headline earnings must be robust and objective. Any voluntary disclosure of the components of a gain or loss will not affect the headline earnings treatment as set out in the rules table.

Format of the headline earnings reconciliation

- .64 Exposure Draft 220 raised the question of whether it was necessary to identify the tax and non-controlling interest for each re-measurement separately. Some respondents were concerned that four-column reconciliation would be too complex and confusing for investors. The suggestion was made that the reconciliation should just include the net amount for each reconciling re-measurement, but still include the detail of the total tax and non-controlling interest amounts attributable to all of the re-measurements.

On the other hand it was acknowledged that this detail was useful and in fact necessary to provide a logical flow between earnings and headline earnings. The decision was therefore taken, in trying to balance these two opposing views, to include the detailed, long-form reconciliation in annual financial statements, but to allow a short-form reconciliation to be provided on a net basis in the interim, preliminary, provisional and abridged reports.

The inclusion of a definition of “operating/trading” and “platform”

- .65 It was necessary to include a definition of “operating/trading” and “platform” in Circular 8/2007 as the meaning of the words “operating” and “capital” as defined in IFRS did not meet the needs of headline earnings, as set out in the circular. The meanings of the words “operating” and “capital” as defined in IFRS are set out below.

- .66 IAS 7 – *Cash Flow Statements* defines “operating activities” as being “the principal revenue-producing activities of an entity and other activities that are not investing or financing activities”.
- .67 The distinction for headline earnings is that some of the financing activities are included within the definition of operating/trading activities. IAS 7 defines “financing activities” widely as “activities that result in changes in the size and composition of the contributed equity and borrowings of the entity”. Operating/trading activities include the costs associated with financing activities and the return on investments.
- .68 Circular 8/2007 uses the word “capital” in the context of non-operating/trading activities or the platform of an entity. This is not necessarily directly aligned with the definition of “capital” in terms of paragraph 4.57 of *The Conceptual Framework for Financial Reporting*, being:
- “under a financial concept of capital, such as invested money or invested purchasing power, the net assets or equity of the entity. The financial concept of capital is adopted by most entities; or
 - under a physical concept of capital, such as operating capability, the productive capacity of the entity based on, for example, units of output per day.”

Specific matters considered when issuing Circular 3/2009

- .69 IFRS 3 (as revised in 2008) introduces a change in the accounting for transaction costs. These are now expensed in profit or loss as opposed to being included in the purchase price. This item is clearly an expense and not a re-measurement and is therefore in headline earnings.
- .70 IFRS 3 (as revised in 2008) deals with the subsequent re-measurement of indemnification assets. These re-measurements have not been dealt with in the detailed rules table as they are not separately identifiable. They are therefore included in headline earnings.
- .71 With regards to IFRS 3 (as revised in 2008), some argued that any changes to the contingent consideration payable for an acquisition (which by definition are included re-measurements) should be excluded from headline earnings as this contingent consideration relates to amounts that are incurred in acquiring a business, which is not part of the normal operating/trading activities of an entity. Paragraph 58 (b) of IFRS 3 referred one to the relevant standard that should be applied for the subsequent measurement of any contingent consideration.

It says that if it is a financial instrument and within the scope of IAS 39, it should be at fair value either through profit or loss or in other comprehensive income. In this case, the headline earnings rules for IAS 39 should be applied and the re-measurement is in headline earnings if the re-measurement is included in profit or loss, and by definition is not in headline earnings if in other comprehensive income. If it is not within the scope of IAS 39, it should be accounted for in accordance with IAS 37 or other IFRSs as appropriate. If such a liability were in the scope of IAS 37, again the headline earnings rule on IAS 37 would apply which rule requires that all re-measurements relating to IAS 37 liabilities are in headline earnings, as on the whole they relate to the trading or operating activities.

- .72 As a reminder, if a fair value adjustment relates to the facts and circumstances that exist at the acquisition date and that arise in the measurement period, the initial accounting will be adjusted accordingly. In this case the adjustment forms part of goodwill and will therefore not be in profit or loss unless an excess arises, which is specifically excluded from headline earnings. IFRS 3 does not permit an adjustment to the initial accounting, even during the measurement period (12 months from the date of acquisition), for any changes to the initial accounting that relate to events or conditions that occurred or arose after the acquisition date.

In this regard, the Basis for Conclusion of IFRS 3 paragraph BC357 states: “Except for adjustments during the measurement period to provisional estimates of fair values at the acquisition date, the boards concluded that subsequent changes in the fair value of a liability for contingent consideration do not affect the acquisition-date fair value of the consideration transferred. Rather, those subsequent changes in value are generally directly related to post-combination events and changes in circumstances related to the combined entity. Thus, subsequent changes in value for post-combination events and circumstances should not affect the measurement of the consideration transferred or goodwill on the acquisition date.

(The boards acknowledge that some changes in fair value might result from events and circumstances related in part to a pre-combination period. But that part of the change is usually indistinguishable from the part related to the post-combination period and the boards concluded that the benefits in those limited circumstances that might result from making such fine distinctions would not justify the costs that such a requirement would impose.)”

- .73 A question was raised in the context of IFRIC 16 – *Hedges of a Net Investment in a Foreign Operation* and the treatment of cash-flow hedges in terms of the rule table for IAS 39. Re-measurements resulting from the hedge of a foreign operation reclassified to profit or loss from other comprehensive income is out of headline earnings. If, however, there is a cash-flow hedge of a forecast acquisition or investment, that re-measurement will be in headline earnings. This may result in a situation where the cash-flow hedge treatment in headline earnings is not in fact matched to the headline earnings implication of the hedged item. There is no separate identification of these different types of cash-flow hedges and therefore all cash-flow hedges must follow the same treatment, being included re-measurements.
- .74 It is considered unusual that IFRIC 17 appears as a separate item in the rules table. The intention is to include the effects of an IASB interpretation in the section dealing with that specific IFRS. IFRIC 17, however, does not deal with one standard and this makes it necessary to include it separately in the rules table.
- .75 The calculation of a consistent P/E ratio is one of the main uses of the headline earnings figure. Given that, other than amendments for terminology changes in IAS 1, the definitions in Section B have not changed in this circular compared to Circular 3/2009, it was agreed that most appropriate way to ensure the consistent application of those principles to amendments to IFRS issued after 30 June 2007 was to have an effective date as close as possible to the date of issue of the exposure draft. An entity that early adopted a new/revised IFRS should have come to the same answer whether it applied this new circular or applied the definitions in the old circular to that new/revised IFRS.

Specific matters considered when issuing Circular 3/2012

- .76 Following a request to urgently revise Circular 3/2009 in June 2012, a replacement Circular 3/2012 was issued to address two issues. The two revisions made to Circular 3/2009 addressed the following matters:
- inconsistencies in the treatment of the changes in the deferred tax balance resulting from the use of a different tax rate that relates to items that were excluded from headline earnings in the current or prior period(s); and
 - to clarify how compensation from third parties for items of property, plant and equipment that were impaired, lost or given up should be accounted for in headline earnings.

Specific matters considered when issuing Circular 2/2013

- .77 Changes to Circular 3/2012 dealt largely with changes to the standards and interpretations issued since 2009. A few other changes were made in order to remove uncertainty that existed in the market place. See the detail of the specific changes in paragraphs .21 and .105.
- .78 A proposal was made to include a new rule to align the treatment of the re-measurement of deferred tax assets to the underlying asset such that if an item was previously excluded from headline earnings the re-measurement of its related deferred tax should also be excluded from headline earnings. Having given detailed consideration to the comments received on this proposed change during the consultation period it was decided not to implement the change at this stage and to leave the rule as it was, with any such re-measurement being included in headline earnings. Concern was expressed as to the practicalities of having to keep track, from period to period, of which asset each specific unrecognised deferred tax assets related to. Concern was also expressed as to the lack of guidance for dealing with the pro rata raising of deferred tax assets. An important consideration for headline earnings is the concept of separately identifiable re-measurements and this proposed change cuts directly into this concept. The treatment of the re-measurement of deferred tax assets, together with the application of IAS 12 to headline earnings as a whole, will be re-deliberated by SAICA sometime in the future.
- .79 Separately identifiable re-measurements in IFRICs/SICs should be treated in the same manner as they would under the IFRSs to which they relate. To clarify how the re-measurements through profit or loss should be treated in headline earnings, the detailed rules table includes relevant IFRICs/SICs with re-measurements not already included in the underlying standard.

Specific matters considered when issuing Circular 2/2015

- .80 Changes to Circular 2/2015 deal largely with changes to the standards and interpretations issued since 2013. Financial assets classified as at fair value through other comprehensive income consist of the following:
- (i) Equity investments that are neither held for trading nor contingent consideration recognised by an acquirer in a business combination to which IFRS 3 applies; and
 - (ii) Other financial assets that are held within a business model whose objective is achieved by both collecting contractual cash flows and selling financial assets and the contractual

terms of the financial asset give rise on specified dates to cash flows that are solely payments of principal and interest on the principal amount outstanding.

The proposed changes to Circular 2/2015 are to align the treatment of the re-measurements with the manner in which these instruments are accounted for in terms of IFRS 9. Fair value gains and losses on equity investments (paragraph .78(i) above) are not reclassified to profit or loss and hence would not be included in headline earnings.

Since financial assets classified as in paragraph .78(ii) above are held for dual purposes, which includes holding the financial asset to collect cash flows, it was proposed to include any such amounts reclassified to profit or loss in headline earnings at the date of any such reclassification. Further, any reclassified gain or loss represents a fair value gain or loss that will either reverse over the time to maturity (being the unwind of a discount or premium) or the recognition of a credit loss, both of which are recognised in the income statement.

It was hence proposed to align the treatment for such assets classified in paragraph .78(ii) above with the headline earnings treatment for financial assets that are held within a business model to collect contractual cash flows and for which similar amounts are included in headline earnings.

Specific matters considered when issuing Circular 4/2018

- .81 Changes to Circular 2/2017 deal largely with changes to the standards and interpretations issued from February 2015 to June 2017, excluding IFRS 17. IFRS 17 which becomes effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2021 and will be considered in the next review of the Circular.
- .82 As IFRS 9 and IFRS 15 become effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2018, it was proposed that the rules relating to IAS 39, IAS 11 and IFRIC 18 should remain in this Circular (refer to paragraph .110 of this Circular) as these will still be applicable at the date of issue of this Circular for entities that have not yet adopted these IFRSs. Moreover, IFRS 9 provides entities with the option to continue to apply the hedge accounting requirements in IAS 39 after IFRS 9 becomes effective. The IFRS 9 rules have been revised to reflect the rules relating to hedge accounting where an entity has elected to apply the hedge accounting requirements in IAS 39.
- .83 IFRS 16 becomes effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2019. It was proposed that the rules relating to IAS 17 should remain in this Circular (refer to paragraph .110 of this Circular) as IAS 17 will still be applicable at the date of issue of this Circular for entities that have not yet adopted this IFRS.
- .84 Two drafting changes were also made. Firstly, changes were made to remove the symbols from the rule table that referenced changes made in 2009 and 2012. The explanation of those changes remains detailed in paragraphs 69 to 76 above, and the original rules are set out in section J below. Secondly, the effective date of certain IFRSs on the rule table, previously included in brackets has been removed as those standards are now effective.

Specific matters considered when issuing Circular X/2019

- .85 Changes to Circular 4/2018 deal only with changing the rules pertaining to IFRS 16. The JSE and SAICA APC received a request for clarification on the treatment of penalties payable upon the termination of a lease that were not initially contracted for in the lease agreement. The request specifically related to the headline earnings treatment of such termination payments. The detailed rules relating to IFRS 16 *Leases* in Section C of Circular 4/2018 indicated the “Remaining amount of the remeasurement of the lease liability to reflect changes to the lease payments recognised in profit or loss” in headline earnings and the “Net gain or loss arising from partial or full termination of lease” out of headline earnings. However, these two items are not *separately identifiable re-measurements* as defined as they are not explicitly required by IFRS 16 to be separately disclosed and therefore should not have appeared in the detailed rules table.
- .86 Headline earnings is defined (as per paragraph .14 above) as “an additional earnings number that is permitted by IAS 33. The starting point is earnings as determined in IAS 33, excluding “*separately identifiable re-measurements*” (as defined), net of related tax (both current and deferred) and related non-controlling interest, other than re-measurements specifically included in headline earnings (“*included re-measurements*”, as defined)”. Therefore, as the items are not *separately identifiable re-measurements*, they should remain in headline earnings. Accordingly, the detailed rules relating to IFRS 16 *Leases* were updated to reflect this.

SECTION I: SECTOR-SPECIFIC RULES FOR HEADLINE EARNINGS

- .87 As explained in Section G, Section I may be updated from time to time to include appropriate industry-specific issues.

Issue 1:**Re-measurements relating to private equity activities (associates or joint ventures) regarded as operating/trading activities****Relevant sector: Listed Banks***Rule*

- .88 All gains or losses on the disposal (or gains or losses recognised in terms of paragraph 42 of IFRS 3 (as revised in 2008)) and distributions to owners in terms of IFRIC 17 of private equity/venture capital, associates or joint ventures which are equity-accounted by listed banks are included re-measurements and must therefore be included in headline earnings. In addition, the required disclosures, as set out in the definition section below, must be provided in each interim-, preliminary-, provisional- and abridged report and in the annual financial statements.
- .89 All investments in associates and joint ventures which meet the definition of those being made by a private equity/venture capital organisation must be dealt with in terms of this rule. There is no flexibility for listed banks (or other entities once they have elected to apply this

rule) to “cherry pick” which of their private equity/venture capital investments should be in or out of headline earnings.

- .90 Therefore, all private equity/venture capital associates and joint ventures, other than those recognised at fair value through profit and loss in accordance with IAS 39/IFRS 9, must be specifically identified and “ring fenced” on initial recognition. Private equity associates and joint ventures in existence at the effective date of this circular must also be specifically identified and “ring fenced”. No subsequent reclassification is allowed in either instance.
- .91 Listed entities, other than listed banks, are entitled, but not obliged, to apply this rule. Any entity that decides to apply this rule cannot reverse the decision at a later date.
- .92 Any listed entity that has an investment in a listed bank must use the reported headline earnings of that listed bank in its own headline earnings calculation.

Effective date

- .93 The effective date for listed banks to apply this rule is for financial periods (interim and/or annual periods) ending on or after 31 August 2007. Any other entity that wishes to apply this rule must also do so for any existing private equity/venture capital equity-accounted associates/joint ventures for financial periods (interim and/or annual periods) ending on or after 31 August 2007. Subsequent voluntary adoption of this rule is only possible for other listed entities if they become a private equity/venture capital organisation for the first time after 31 August 2007. Early adoption is permitted, but not for results published before 1 September 2007.

Basis for the rule

- .94 The Banking Association of South Africa, with the unanimous support of all of the listed banks, made representation to the interested parties group in terms of Section G of this circular to create a specific rule for the banks’ private equity investments. Its motivation for this rule is set out below.
- .95 Private equity/venture capital businesses are involved in purchasing investments with the main objective of realising a return on their investment through a combination of dividends, management fees, interest income and profit on the sale of the investments. All investments are made with the view to disposal in the medium term. Consequently, investments are effectively the stock in trade or inventory of the private equity/venture capital business and any profit realised on the disposal of these investments is considered to be part of the trading results of these operations.
- .96 In the case of certain associates and joint ventures, the headline earnings treatment for the gains or losses on disposal of these businesses, as set out in Section C, is based on the classification by management on initial recognition of the investments. If a comparison between two private equity/venture capital entities is made, one having elected to equity account investments and the other to fair value the investments through profit and loss, the headline earnings of the two entities will differ vastly both annually and over the life of the investment, although they operate with the same intention, manage their businesses on the same basis and view the underlying investments on a similar basis, i.e. as inventory.

- .97 The Banking Association further believes that it is important to note that IAS 28 – *Investments in Associates and Joint Ventures* permits a private equity/venture capital business to recognise an investment in an associate or joint venture at fair value through profit or loss instead of applying equity-accounting. Electing to apply the equity method of accounting does not imply that the investment is part of the capital or platform of the business. The entity has a free choice in making the election. It is contended therefore that there is no justification for using the accounting policy election option provided in IAS 28 as a basis for determining whether an investment is part of the operating/trading or platform of the business.

Definitions

- .98 The definitions applicable to this rule are set out below.

Private equity/venture capital equity accounted associates/joint ventures are any investments made by private equity/venture capital organisations that could fall within the exemptions from applying the equity method in paragraph 18 of IAS 28.

A private equity/venture capital organisation is one that must:

- (i) have, as its principal business, the provision of equity finance to unlisted entities and make its returns mainly through medium- to long-term capital gain. These activities may include start-up and other early stage expansion, management buy-out or management buy-in investment, which includes “equity-type” return;
- (ii) have experienced executives engaged full-time in venture capital and private equity investment;
- (iii) have venture capital and private equity funds under management having made at least one investment in Southern Africa and be actively making investments; and
- (iii) take an active role in helping to build and develop the companies in which it invests.

A listed bank is an entity listed on the main board of the JSE in the “Banking” sub-sector of the “Financial” industry classification. To ensure that the objective of headline earnings for consistency is maintained, this rule must be applied to all listed banks.

Interim report, preliminary report, provisional report and abridged report are as defined in the JSE Listings Requirements.

The required disclosure includes separate and additional disclosure of the following information for the private equity/venture capital associates or joint ventures (as defined) that are not recognised at fair value through profit and loss in accordance with IAS 39/IFRS 9:

- (i) All financial information relating to the associates or joint ventures being:
 - a. the aggregate cost;
 - b. the aggregate carrying value of these investments at the reporting date;
 - c. the equity-accounted income for the period for equity-accounted associates and joint ventures;
 - d. the aggregate other income earned for the period (such as management fees); and
 - e. the aggregate realised gains or losses on disposal for the period;

- (ii) The aggregate fair value of the investments in associates or joint ventures.

These required disclosures are necessary to align this sector-specific rule with the separately identifiable objective contained in the headline earnings definition.

Issue 2:

The re-measurement of investment property

Relevant sector: Financial – Listed Life Insurance (other sectors must apply this rule to their long-term insurer and its subsidiaries and associates)

Rule

- .99 All gains or losses (unrealised and realised) on the re-measurement (which by definition includes a disposal) of all investment properties are included re-measurements and must therefore be included in headline earnings. This rule applies irrespective of whether the investment property was purchased with policyholders or shareholders' funds and irrespective of whether the entity's accounting policy is to measure its investment properties at cost or fair value. In addition, the required disclosure, as set out in the definition section below, must be provided in each interim-, preliminary-, provisional- and abridged report, and in the annual financial statements.
- .100 This rule applies to all investment properties of a listed life insurer, a long-term insurer and all of the listed life insurer's and long-term insurer's subsidiaries and associates. Any listed entity that has a listed life insurer as a subsidiary or associate must use the reported headline earnings of that listed entity in its own headline earnings calculation.

Effective date

- .101 The effective date for the listed life insurers and the long-term insurer subsidiaries and associates of entities listed in other sectors of the JSE to apply this rule is for all financial periods (interim and/or annual periods) ending on or after 31 January 2008. Early adoption is permitted but not for results published before 22 February 2008, the date on which this rule was issued.

Basis for the rule

- .102 The SAICA long-term insurance industry group, with the unanimous support of all of the long-term insurers that are either listed themselves or are part of a group that is listed, made representation to the interested parties group in terms of Section G of this circular to create a specific rule for their investment properties. Their motivation and the response from the interested parties group are set out below.
- .103 There is concern that the treatment of fair value re-measurements and the profits or losses on disposal of investment properties, as currently set out in Section C, is inappropriate for the life insurers.

- .104 The nature of the operations of a long-term insurer is to invest in assets that will provide the required return in order to make payments to policyholders as and when they arise. Long-term insurers hold investment properties for the following purposes:
- in order to match policyholder liabilities relating to policy contracts where the return on the contract is matched to the value of the asset (in this case the investment property), or where the policy contract contains a discretionary participation feature, or to match policyholder liabilities relating to insurance contracts; and/or
 - in order to invest shareholders' equity (i.e. surplus capital)
- .105 In the case of investment properties acquired to match policyholder liabilities, these investments do not form part of the platform of the long-term insurer. These investments meet the definition of an operating/trading activity as they form part of those activities carried out using the platform. Paragraph .14 of Circular 8/2007 defines "included re-measurements" as those that relate to the operating/trading activities of the entity.
- .106 The operating performance from investment properties can be realised in two ways by the long-term insurer, either through capital appreciation, or through rental income. The capital appreciation and the rental income are both required to match the increase in the policyholder liability. Rental income is already included in the operating activities of the long-term insurer and thus there is a misalignment in terms of the current Section C rule where the capital appreciation of the investment property is not considered part of the operating activities. The re-measurement of the policyholder liability (under insurance and investment contracts) remains within headline earnings.
- .107 The interested parties group considered to the arguments of the SAICA long-term insurance industry group. Concern was raised, however, about the separately identifiable nature of the re-measurement referred to. Paragraph .55 of Circular 8/2007 states that only re-measurements where the applicable IFRS requires disclosure of the operating/trading and/or platform portion of the re-measurement can be adjusted in headline earnings. It goes on to acknowledge that re-measurements may include both a platform and an operating/trading nature. The rule table has been written on the basis of whether the platform or operating/trading portion of the re-measurement makes up the majority portion of that re-measurement. The SAICA long-term insurance industry group acknowledges that by far the majority of its investment properties are held to match policyholder liabilities. It has thus been agreed that all re-measurements relating to investment properties (whether using policyholders or shareholders' funds) will be regarded as included re-measurements.

Definitions

- .108 The definitions applicable to this rule are set out below.

Financial risk is the risk of a possible future change in one or more of a specified interest rate, financial instrument price, commodity price, foreign exchange rate, index of prices or rates, credit rating or credit index or other variable, provided in the case of a non-financial variable that the variable is not specific to a party to the contract.

An **insurance contract** is a contract under which one party (the insurer) accepts significant insurance risk from another party (the policyholder) by agreeing to compensate the policyholder if a specified uncertain future event (the insured event) adversely affects the policyholder.

Insurance risk is risk, other than financial risk, transferred from the holder of a contract to the issuer.

Investment contracts are contracts that do not transfer significant insurance risk, but transfer financial risk. An investment contract is any contract that gives rise to a financial asset of one entity and a financial liability or equity instrument of another entity.

An **investment property** is an investment property as defined in IAS 40, measured at fair value or at cost.

A **listed life insurer** is a long-term insurer listed on the main board of the JSE in the “Financial – Life Insurance” sector.

A **long-term insurer** is an entity that has, as its principal business, the issuing of long-term insurance and/or long-term investment contracts, and is registered as a long-term insurer in terms of the Long-term Insurance Act of 1998.

Policyholder means the person entitled to be provided with the policy benefits under an investment or long-term insurance contract.

The required disclosure involves informing the reader that that the headline earnings of insurers includes re-measurements of investment properties, which re-measurements are largely attributable to policyholders.

SECTION J: CHANGES MADE TO THE DETAILED RULES TABLE

.109 Circular 8/2007 was subsequently amended in 2009, 2012 and 2013. The rules that have changed:

- (i) since the issue of Circular 8/2007 were indicated in the rule table with an *;
- (ii) since the issue of Circular 3/2009 were indicated in the rule table with a #;
- (iii) since the issue of Circular 3/2012 are indicated in the rule table in paragraph 21 of this Circular with a □ or Δ;
- (iv) since the issue of Circular 3/2012 are indicated in the rule table with a ○ ;
- (v) since the issue of Circular 2/2015 are indicated in the rule table with a ☒; and
- (vi) since the issue of Circular 4/2018 are indicated in the rule table with a ☑.

.110 The amendments and revisions contained in Circular 3/2009 reflects changes in IFRS from 30 June 2007 to 30 April 2009. The original rules are set out below:

Standard/ Interpretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IFRS 3	<p><i>Business Combinations</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goodwill impairment. • Excess of acquirer’s interest in the net fair value of the acquiree’s identifiable assets, liabilities and contingent liabilities over cost (previously referred to as “negative goodwill”) adjustments. • Goodwill adjustments recognised as result of the subsequent recognition of a 		<p>X</p> <p>X</p> <p>X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Re-measurement. • In order to align the treatment with goodwill, it is treated on the same basis. • Re-measurement (see also IAS 12 where the corresponding gain is

HEADLINE EARNINGS

Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline Earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IAS 12*	<p><i>Income Taxes</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increases or decreases in the deferred tax balance resulting from a change in tax rate. <p>(Note: Changes in the deferred tax balance that do not affect profit or loss are not included in headline earnings as these changes are not included in basic earnings.)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gain arising from the recognition of deferred tax asset resulting from an assessed loss: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Initial recognition. Reassessment of recoverability of deferred tax asset. 	X	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Included re-measurement (i) as defined. Not a re-measurement. Included re-measurement (i) as defined, as this is dependent on future profits.
IAS 16 *	<p><i>Property, Plant and Equipment</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Depreciation. Impairment/subsequent reversal of impairment. Disposal gains/losses. <p>(Note 1: Gains on revaluation of property, plant and equipment will not be included in headline earnings, as they are not included in profit or loss.)</p> <p>(Note 2: Gains and losses on sale of assets previously held for rental, now transferred to inventory in terms of IAS 16 paragraph 68A, should be dealt with in terms of IAS 2.)</p>	X	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Included re-measurement (ii) as defined. Re-measurement of an asset. Re-measurement of an asset.

.112 The amendments and revisions contained in Circular 2/2013 reflect changes in IFRS from 30 April 2009 to 30 April 2013. The revised rules are contained in the rule table in paragraph.21 and are marked with a Δ. New rules for new standards are marked with an □. Furthermore changes were introduced to clarify certain aspects specifically:

- (i) IFRS 5 where there is a change in a plan with regard to an asset or group of assets held for sale;
- (ii) IAS 17 has been added for completeness. (Standards dealing with disclosure issues alone have not been added to the rule table);
- (iii) IAS 16/IAS 38 for the subsequent measurement of the compensation receivable;

HEADLINE EARNINGS

**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

- (iv) IFRIC 1, IFRIC 18 and SIC 25 have been added for completeness because these interpretations deal with re-measurements not already included in the underlying standard (Interpretations dealing with disclosure issues alone have not been added to the rule table); and
- (v) IFRS10/IAS 28 where an entity carries an investment in subsidiaries, associates and joint ventures at fair value.

Note: Whilst Circular 2/2013 was originally issued in August 2013, it was reissued in December 2013 to incorporate a few editorial corrections in the table namely:

- Amendment of the table for IFRS 3 to correct an alignment of the marker (X) showing what was included and excluded from headline earnings;
- Minor wording changes were made in the new IFRS 5 wording;
- The wording “the time value of money” was added in IAS 16 and IAS 38 after “Due to the unwinding of the discount”;
- The wording discussed in (v) above was inserted to highlight what to do if a subsidiary/ associate/joint venture is carried at fair value in the consolidated or group financial statements; and
- The word “subsidiary” has been removed from Issue 1 of the Sector-specific rules for headline earnings pertaining to “re-measurements relating to private equity activities (associates or joint ventures) regarded as operating/trading activities”. The word had been inserted in error in the drafting of the version of the Circular issued in August 2013.

The original rules included in Circular 2/2013 are set out below:

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline Earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IFRS 3 *	<p><i>Business Combinations</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goodwill impairment. • The recognised gain from a bargain purchase. • Transaction costs. • Subsequent re-measurement of contingent liabilities. • Subsequent amortisation of reacquired rights. • Subsequent re-measurement of contingent consideration (Note: there is no re-measurement if it is equity classified). • Gains or losses on deemed disposals in terms of paragraph 42 where the disposal is of an asset previously accounted for as a: 		<p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Re-measurement. • In order to align the treatment with goodwill, it is treated on the same basis. • Not a re-measurement. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined. • Included re-measurement (ii) as defined. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined. <p>Re-measurement is dealt with in terms of the normal rules for a gain or loss on disposal.</p>

HEADLINE EARNINGS

**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline Earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
	-Joint venture -Associate -IAS 39 financial asset at fair value through profit or loss -IAS 39 financial asset classified as an available-for-sale	X	X X X	
IFRS 5	<p><i>Non-current Assets Held for Sale and Discontinued Operations</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discontinued operations: where disposal of an entity meets the definition of a discontinued operation: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – the post-tax profit or loss of discontinued operations; – the post-tax gain or loss recognised on the measurement to fair value, less costs to sell, in terms of paragraphs 20 to 24 or on the disposal of the assets or disposal group(s) constituting the discontinued operations. • Gains or losses in terms of paragraphs 20 to 24 on non-current assets or disposal groups held for sales (which include subsidiaries, joint ventures and equity-accounted associates). For current assets and current liabilities that are part of disposal groups, this only refers to the disposal group as a whole and therefore does not apply to those items not within the measurement scope of IFRS 5. <p>For example, it is noted that financial assets are excluded from the measurement scope of IFRS 5 and thus any adjustments on such items would follow the IAS 39 rules for headline earnings. Only the gains or losses on re-measuring the disposal group as a whole would be excluded.</p>	X	X X X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not a re-measurement. • Re-measurement. • Re-measurement.

HEADLINE EARNINGS

**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline Earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IAS 16	<p><i>Property, Plant and Equipment</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depreciation. • Impairment/subsequent reversal of impairment. • Disposal gains/losses. • Compensation from third parties for items of property, plant and equipment that were impaired, lost or given up <p>(Note 1: Gains on revaluation of property, plant and equipment will not be included in headline earnings, as they are not included in profit or loss.)</p> <p>(Note 2: Gains and losses on sale of assets previously held for rental, now transferred to inventory in terms of IAS 16 paragraph 68A, should be dealt with in terms of IAS 2.)</p>	X	X X X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (ii) as defined. • Re-measurement of an asset. • Re-measurement of an asset. • Re-measurement of an asset.
IAS 19	<p><i>Employee Benefits</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Actuarial gains/losses on recognition in profit or loss (including unexpected returns on plan assets or reimbursement rights). • Curtailments and settlements of defined benefit plans (as contemplated by paragraphs 109 – 115). • The effect of the limit in paragraph 58(b), unless recognised outside profit and loss in accordance with paragraph 93C. <p>(Note: Actuarial gains and losses taken directly to other comprehensive income in terms of IAS 19, paragraph 93A will not be included in headline earnings, as they are not included in basic earnings.)</p>	X X X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (i) as defined, as they are part of employee costs and therefore part of operating/ trading activities. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined, as they are part of employee costs and therefore part of operating/ trading activities. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined.

HEADLINE EARNINGS

**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline Earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IAS 27	<i>Consolidated and Separate Financial Statements</i> • Gains/losses on the loss of control of the subsidiary.		X	• Re-measurement of an asset.
IAS 28/IAS 31	<i>Accounting for Investments in Associates and Joint Ventures</i> • Gains/losses on the disposal of the associate/joint venture. The equity-accounted earnings of associates and joint ventures.		X	• Re-measurement of an asset. The rules contained in this table apply equally to the underlying earnings of the associate. For example, the gain on disposal of a non-current asset (or property plant and equipment) by an associate is excluded from headline earnings, i.e. the “look-through” approach is followed.
IAS 40	<i>Investment Property</i> • Any adjustments/re-measurements in terms of this standard.		X	• Re-measurement of an asset.

.113 The amendments and revisions contained in Circular 2/2015 reflect changes in IFRSs from May 2013 to February 2015. The revised rules are contained in the rule table in paragraph.21 and are marked with . The original rules included in Circular 2/2013 are set out below:

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IFRS 9 <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Financial Instruments (effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2015)</i> • All re-measurements through profit or loss	X		• Included re-measurement (v) as defined.

.114 The amendments and revisions contained in Circular 4/2018 reflect changes in IFRSs (excluding IFRS 17) and new Interpretations issued from March 2015 to June 2017. The revised and new rules are contained in the rule table in paragraph.21 and are marked with . The original rules included in Circular 2/2015 are set out below:

HEADLINE EARNINGS
**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IFRS 9 <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="radio"/>	<p><i>Financial Instruments (effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2018)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All re-measurements through profit or loss. • The reclassification of any re-measurements from other comprehensive income to profit or loss. • Except for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The reclassification of other comprehensive income to profit or loss, for a hedge of a net investment in a foreign operation. <p>(Note: IFRS 9 investments in equity instruments included in other comprehensive income – these are not recognised in profit or loss, therefore they do not affect headline earnings).</p>	<p>X</p> <p>X</p>	<p>X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (vii) as defined. • Included re-measurement (vii) as defined. • Excluded re-measurement (vii) as defined.
IFRS 10 <input type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Consolidated Financial Statements (effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2013)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gains/losses on the loss of control of a subsidiary. <p>(Note 1: Supersedes IAS 27 – <i>Consolidated and Separate Financial Statements</i>).</p> <p>(Note 2: Investment entities (as defined by IFRS 10) with an investment in a subsidiary carried at fair value should refer to IAS 39/IFRS 9's headline earnings' requirements).</p>		<p>X</p>	<p>Re-measurement.</p>
IFRS 11 <input type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Joint Arrangements (effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2013)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Re-measurements of assets and liabilities recognised in relation to joint operations should be dealt with in terms of the detailed rules applicable to the IFRSs relevant to each specific item. • Re-measurement related to interests in joint ventures should be dealt with in terms of the detailed rules applicable to the IFRS that has been applied. For example, IAS 28 if equity accounted or IFRS 9 or IAS 39 if recognised at fair value through profit or loss. 			

HEADLINE EARNINGS
**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
	(Note 1: The impact of the transition to IFRS 11 does not impact headline earnings as it is not included in profit or loss). (Note 2: Supersedes IAS 31 – <i>Interests in Joint Ventures</i>).			
IAS 11	<i>Construction Contracts</i> • Changes in provisions for future losses. Percentage of completion revenue recognition.	X X		• Included re-measurement (i) as defined as part of normal trading activities. Included re-measurement (i) as part of normal trading activities.
IAS 17 Δ	<i>Leases</i> Sale and Leaseback Finance Lease • Excess proceeds over the carrying amount from a sale and lease back transaction, that results in a finance lease, that are amortised over the lease term in accordance with IAS 17, paragraph 59. Operating Lease • Profit or loss from the sale and operating leaseback transaction itself. (The same rules apply as for the disposal of property, plant and equipment). Deferred profits or losses from a sale and leaseback transaction, which results in an operating lease.	X X	 X	• Included re-measurement (i) as defined. • Re-measurement of an asset. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined.
IAS 19 Δ	<i>Employee Benefits (amended IAS 19 effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2013)</i> All re-measurements recognised through profit or loss.	X		Included re-measurement (i) as defined, as they are part of the employee benefit costs and therefore operating/trading activities as defined.
IAS 27 Δ	<i>Separate Financial Statements</i> • Gains/losses on the loss of control of the subsidiary. (Note 1: IAS 27 – <i>Consolidated and Separate Financial Statements</i> was superseded by IFRS 10 – <i>Consolidated Financial Statements</i> and IAS 27 – <i>Separate Financial Statements</i> effective 1 January 2013).		X	• Re-measurement of an asset.

HEADLINE EARNINGS

**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

Standard/ Inter- pretation	Item	In headline earnings	Out of headline earnings	Reason(s)
IAS 28 Δ	<p><i>Investments in Associates and Joint Ventures</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gains/losses on the disposal of the associate/joint venture • The equity-accounted earnings of associates and joint ventures. <p>(Note 1: Supersedes IAS 28 – <i>Investments in Associates</i> and IAS 31 – <i>Interest in Joint Ventures</i>).</p> <p>(Note 2: Entities with an investment in an associate or joint venture that is carried at fair value should refer to IAS 39/IFRS 9’s headline earnings requirements).</p>		X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Re-measurement of an asset. <p>The rules contained in this table apply equally to the underlying earnings of the associate. For example, the gain on disposal of non-current asset (or property plant and equipment) by an associate is excluded from headline earnings, i.e. the “look-through” approach is followed.</p>
IAS 39	<p><i>Financial Instruments: Recognition and Measurement</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All re-measurements recognised in profit or loss; • Except: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – the reclassification of gains and losses on available-for-sale financial assets upon impairment or disposal and subsequent impairment losses; • But, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – amounts recognised in profit or loss under cash-flow hedges that were previously recognised directly in other comprehensive income. • The reclassification of all other re-measurements from other comprehensive income to profit or loss, including <i>inter alia</i> a hedge of a net investment in a foreign operation. <p>(Note: To be superseded by IFRS 9 effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2018.)</p>	X	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (v) as defined. • Re-measurement falling outside of the definition of an included re-measurement (v). • Included re-measurement (vi) as defined. • Excluded re-measurement (v) as defined.
IFRIC 18 □	<p><i>Transfers of Assets from Customers</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The recognition of property, plant and equipment as a result of a transfer from the customer would either result in revenue immediately or over a period of time. Therefore the same treatment as under IAS 18 should be followed. 	X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (i) is defined.

.115 The amendments contained in Circular X/2019 reflect the change to IFRS 16. The revised rules are contained in the rule table in paragraph.21 and are marked with ☑. The original rules included in Circular 4/2018 are set out below:

HEADLINE EARNINGS

**Circular X/2019
(Replacing 4/2018)**

<p>IFRS 16 ☒</p>	<p><i>Leases (effective for annual periods beginning on or after 1 January 2019)</i></p> <p><i>Lessees</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depreciation – right-of-use asset. • Impairment/subsequent reversal of impairment of the right-of-use asset • Remaining amount of the remeasurement of the lease liability to reflect changes to the lease payments recognised in profit or loss. • Net gain or loss arising from partial or full termination of lease. <p>(Note 1: Gains on revaluation of right-of-use will not be included in headline earnings because they are not included in profit or loss.)</p> <p>(Note 2: Remeasurements of the right-of-use-asset classified as investment property should be dealt with in terms of headline earnings requirements applicable to IAS 40).</p> <p>(Note 3: Items not detailed above are not re-measurements and therefore have not been dealt with.)</p> <p><i>Lessors</i></p> <p>All remeasurements included in profit or loss.</p> <p>Except for: Operating lease</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impairment/subsequent reversal of impairment of the underlying non-financial asset. <p>Sale and leaseback Transfer of the asset is a sale</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gain or loss arising from rights transferred to the buyer/lessor (The same rules apply as for the disposal of property, plant and equipment). 	<p>X</p> <p>X</p> <p>X</p> <p>X</p> <p>X</p> <p>X</p>	<p>X</p> <p>X</p> <p>X</p> <p>X</p> <p>X</p> <p>X</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included re-measurement (ii) as defined. • Re-measurement of an asset. • Included re-measurement (i) as defined • Re-measurement of an asset. • Included re-measurement (ii), (v) and (vii) as defined. • Remeasurement of an asset • Remeasurement of an asset
----------------------	---	---	---	---

**Johannesburg
November 2019**